

ATTACHMENT A: Public Comments Regarding Area of Potential Effects

Description:

Public comments directly related to the Area of Potential Effect (APE) including those from the Consulting Parties Meeting held 20 September 2023 are listed in the tables attached. All comments submitted to ANC were searched using phrases that included Area of Potential Effect(s), Area of Effect(s), Area of Affect (in case of misspellings), Area of Impact(s), and APE. A total of 34 comments have been received that specifically discuss the area of potential effects using these phrases previously listed. All commentors have been assigned an identifier to keep all comments anonymous to the public. The tables only provide the identifier and the comment pertaining to the APE. Comments regarding additional topics are separated out and given their own entry.

Assigned Commentor Number	Comment Regarding Area of Potential Effect (APE)
PA-005310B	Any action to remove the Memorial, or parts of the Memorial, would also cause irreparable adverse physical and visual effects on the Arlington National Cemetery Historic District. The Memorial is recognized as an important part of this historic site and its cultural and historic landscape. There is no conceivable way to mitigate the adverse effects on the Arlington National Cemetery Historic District that would be caused by removal of the Memorial, or removal of any of the Memorial's elements.
PA-005456B	It goes without saying, of course, that the area most immediately affected by the monument's removal would be Section 16 itself, brutally denuded of its historic centerpiece in a crude act of officially-sanctioned vandalism. The nation can't afford to cancel the landmarks that tell us where we've been as a polity and a culture. We need those landmarks, and we need to retain Ezekiel's masterwork.
PA-005456C	But one area that would certainly be grievously affected is the great civic-art ensemble that includes the Lincoln Memorial, Arlington Memorial Bridge, Arlington House and Arlington National Cemetery. This monumental ensemble, perhaps the nation's greatest, signifies the reconciliation of North and South reflected in the resumption of military service by Southerners in the Spanish-American War. Ezekiel's monument was conceived in the spirit of reconciliation. It was an elegy to the valor displayed by the Confederate warrior in service to a cause that was definitively lost. That elegiac character is fully consistent, needless to say, with a funerary monument serving as a grave marker.
PA-005456D	Because of its exceptional artistic quality and symbolic resonance, the monument's removal would seriously degrade the civic-art ensemble in question.
PA-003847B	this memorial clearly qualifies for National Register status, and its area of effect is all of Arlington, and really all of America, because of Arlington's unique position in the American psyche, and is essential to our national morale.
PA-004545G	The integration and extensive influence of this memorial on the entire ANC National Historical District can not be denied. The phrase, "out of sight- out of mind" applies. To remove the Reconciliation Memorial is to remove any thought of reconciliation at all. Thus removing the poignant significance of the entire Arlington concept: from mansion to graveyard. Arlington itself will then become irrelevant. The motto "HonorRemember-Explore" , will become" Dishonor-Forget- Ignore".

Assigned Commentor Number	Comment Regarding Area of Potential Effect (APE)
PA-003526B	The correct area of potential effect would be a direct effect on the monument, both direct (as the monument is part of Arlington Cemetery's landscape and specifically the Confederate section) and indirect in the visual of the cemetery.
PA-003538N	This Reconciliation Memorial is a part of the culture not only of America but the world. To say that the effect is limited to a small part of a cemetery is disingenuous. This Memorial is eligible to be a contributing object of its own historical significance in Arlington National Cemetery, which is a National Register Historic District which is the only National Military Cemetery with that designation. Former Secretary of the Navy Jim Webb's recent Op Ed in the Wall Street Journal shows how the memorial is a testament to how to re-unify a nation after a civil war. He used it with officials in Vietnam. If America cannot accept its own reconciliation, how can we promote it to other war torn cultures. The APE, as proposed, is just a small area inside the cemetery. This ignores the importance of the reconciliation message that America set by example for the world after our own bloody fratricidal war.
PA-003538O	This memorial is part of the Washington Monumental Corridor Master Plan. The Monumental Corridor was part of the "American Renaissance" and North-South linkage promoted by renowned architects McMillan and Olmstead. They envisioned a "city beautiful" plan for Washington, DC that extended over the Potomac River into Virginia to Arlington House and the Cemetery. The bridge was to become a symbolic link between North and South from DC to Arlington and the addition of George Washington Memorial Parkway, punctuated with monuments and memorial evidenced this American Renaissance and to demonstrate to the world American unification. This beaux arts style memorial, is the most significant monumental artwork at Arlington is part of the American Renaissance which ignited in monumental art around the country., and as such is individually eligible for inclusion on the National Register. The entire Monumental Corridor, the Viewshed from Mount Vernon through to the Capitol must be included in the APE as they are part of the master plan and significant in the northsouth reunification and the American Renaissance. The entire viewshed of the Washington Monumental core Master Plan but be included.
PA-003869B	I would also say, Ah, this reconciliation memorial is part of the culture of not only America, but of the world. To say that the effect is limited to a small part. Cemetery is disingenuous, the area of potential effect being considered is too small.

Assigned Commentor Number	Comment Regarding Area of Potential Effect (APE)
PA-004421A	The Area of Potential Effect as part of the 106 issue is clearly impossible due to the location of graves. It should be obvious that a cemetery would not want to damage the gravesites of anyone who is buried in the cemetery, let alone soldiers at Arlington National Cemetery
PA-002655D	I am also concerned about the significant environmental issues and potential impacts of this project. The monument should be National Register eligible; and moving it could impact an area of potential effects and/or prohibit identification of historic properties. If the monument is National Register eligible, it should be kept – as-is – and formal petition filed to seek this important status for this priceless art work and historic piece of American history.
PA-004420C	Area of potential effects (APE) A cemetery should be a place to leave conflict “outside the gates.” This monument helps to reinforce the resolution of conflict.
PA-004450B	The scope ANC is TOO SMALL, for the EIS, by much, because this "Reconciliation" monument is part of a larger schematic of objects supporting the re-unification of the United States after the War (1861-1865.)
PA-004545D	It's area of actual and potential effect is far beyond Jackson Circle and Section 16, but outwards to all of Arlington. The origin story of Arlington House and how the it became the nation's truly National Military cemetery is encapsulated in it . And, the memorial's reach is really all across America and across the world, given the reverence and prominence we have bestowed on it. Without this memorial, there is no reason why Arlington is anything special. With it, Arlington says to the world what we can aspre to. It is leading by example. This has been reiterated by many Presidents over the years who placed wreaths at the memorial. We don't want to repudiate this message and send one out to our allies and adversaries that revenge and retribution is condoned and appropriate. Arlington Cemetery has a unique place in the American psyche and is essential to our national morale.
PA-009763F	The Area of Potential Effect far exceeds the proposed APE, as the loss of this piece of Art owned by the American Citizens is not replaceable.

Assigned Commentor Number	Comment Regarding Area of Potential Effect (APE)
PA-005751W	<p>The Memorial as a Contributing Resource to a Broader Monument Core</p> <p>This memorial is part of the Washington Monumental Corridor Master Plan. The Monumental Corridor was part of the “American Renaissance” and North-South linkage promoted by renowned architects McMillan and Olmstead. They envisioned a “city beautiful” plan for Washington, DC that extended over the Potomac River into Virginia to Arlington House and the Cemetery. The bridge was to become a symbolic link between North and South from DC to Arlington and the addition of the George Washington Memorial Parkway, punctuated with monuments and memorials evidenced this American Renaissance, and to demonstrate to the world American unification. This beaux-arts style memorial is the most significant monumental artwork at Arlington, and part of the American Renaissance which ignited a movement to build monumental art around the country. The entire Monumental Corridor, the Viewshed from Mount Vernon through to the Capitol, must be included in the EIS study area and the NHPA Area of Potential Effects (“APE”), as they are part of the master plan and significant in the north-south reunification and the American Renaissance. The APE must be expanded to include the entire Viewshed of the Washington Monumental core.</p>
PA-008742C	<p>in the EIS study area and the NHPA Area of Potential Effects (“APE”), as they are part of the master plan and significant in the north-south reunification and the American Renaissance. The APE must be expanded to include the entire Viewshed of the Washington Monumental core.</p>
PA-008614D	<p>The APE that you come up with, and we have no understanding of who it's supposed to impact.</p>
PA-008489C	<p>That's why the APE needs to be expanded because this will have an effect on the fact of moving future monuments from Federal lands. I'm currently out in South Dakota right now, and there are people there who bought and killed Federal troops out here, and their monument is located on the battlefield right next to the National Monument. There a little bit more. This could affect that location. As well leave the reconciliation money alone. Deal with the real issues facing our country. Don't allow a temporary political agenda to ruin our precious national treasures there, or at Little Bighorn, or any other place across the United States.</p>

Assigned Commentor Number	Comment Regarding Area of Potential Effect (APE)
PA-008684A	<p>we strongly object to the Army's attempt to fast track the required rate for reviews, and this being one of them, has anyone reached out to the other nations because I have had several citizens from other countries contact me on Facebook and say what the heck is going on here. One was a Canadian. He reached out to me, and there is a Canadian Confederate soldier buried in the shadow of the Reconciliation Memorial. A Polish man, you know. It's closest, and as far as way as Poland. I had a Polish man contact me and said, What the heck are you all doing? The big thing is that that we haven't onto a fully encompassing everyone out there on the APE, you know, to define it. This is not given full respect to who it affects, and it affects everybody there, especially in regards to the Jewish community. What has been done on the outreach on this? Thank you.</p>
PA-006203A	<p>The Area of Potential Effect as part of the 106 issue is clearly impossible due to the location of graves. It should be obvious that a cemetery would not want to damage the gravesites of anyone who is buried in the cemetery, let alone soldiers at Arlington National Cemetery.</p>
PA-006231C	<p>To disturb the atmosphere of this cemetery will have effects that are far larger than the so-called "Area of Potential Effect"; the disfigurement of National Harmony, History, and Culture which will ensue if this plan to rip out Moses Ezekiel's headstone aka The Arlington National Confederate Memorial aka The Reconciliation Memorial will effect the Spiritual Environment of the Cemetery and upset the resting spirits of all the Hallowed Dead, whose duty, integrity, and resolve puts the elected who voted for this artistic assault TO SHAME; disturbing the monument will also have the Enormous Potential Effect of creating a ripple of division in America that may very well turn into a TSUNAMI of acrimony between groups whose differences were not inflamed as little as three years ago.</p>
PA-008477A	<p>I do believe that the APE should be expanded, and the rationale for that is in Section 16, where the monument resides, the reconciliation memorial, there are Confederate Service members, veterans who are American veterans. They represent each and every Confederate State or former Confederate State. I should say so to me logically, even on the memorial itself, it names and lists each one of those States. I think those State SHPOs should be involved. I believe we haven't had any commentary from them. It's going to impact there. You know, residents, their citizens, because their citizens are people who descend from some of the men who are buried in Section Sixteen, and some of the spouses as well. So I think, to just narrowly define it and keep it limited to ANC itself is too small of an area, because I think this impacts each one of these states has a quote-unquote dog in the hunt. They should be able to come here and provide commentary and try to help move the ball forward.</p>

Assigned Commentor Number	Comment Regarding Area of Potential Effect (APE)
PA-008465A	The APE should include everything that was in the Macmillan Olmsted plan. It should be much wider with George Washington National Parkway. This was all part of a complete program to memorialize the healing and the reconciliation of the United States after the war between the States and finished after the Spanish-American war, so that this area needs to be expanded, and that's my comment.
PA-008468A	I agree with the previous speakers that the area of potential effect is really much broader at the minimum, including the entire United States, because this particular memorial ties together all the other memorials at national parks, especially battlefields. Anything that has to do with the war between the States, and it actually has a worldwide effect, because it affects the perception of Jewish artists worldwide. That's why GDP Benjamin Friends are particularly interested. You know, a focus of the national attention was the vision of McKinley when he initiated this entire project. The APE is much broader than just the circumference of Arlington National Cemetery. Thank you.
PA-008453A	a quick comment is that the area of permitted effects APE has yet to be finally determined, and that is, the army has not considered the memorial itself as a contributing resource to a broader monument core and part of the Washington Monumental Corridor Master Plan, as explained in the Defend Arlington comments. As explained the views from Mount Vernon through the capital must be included in the NHPA area of potential effects. Thank you.
PA-008474A	At this time I believe that the APE should include all areas.
PA-008455A	I think the APE is much too small, that it should include the entire Washington Monumental Corridor Master Plan, and also our Ernie Blevins, scholar of monuments of this period, said that the Confederate memorial is really the headstone of the entire Confederacy. So really the APE is really the entire country, the entire South at least.
PA-008448A	I think the APE is everywhere with no exception. Site 16 can be viewed from everywhere and that's about it for my comment.
PA-008458A	The APE should include, to be thorough, not only any memorial or monument in Arlington National Cemetery, but all monuments and memorials nationwide, to include the entire country, everywhere. If it's good for one area, it should be good for everything.
PA-010375A	You are asking for comments on the "Effect" before you have finalized the "Area of Potential Effect" (APE), or identified the Affected Resources. Consulting parties cannot comment on the effects until a complete explanation of the proposed action is provided.

Assigned Commentor Number	Comment Regarding Area of Potential Effect (APE)
PA-010371A	<p>Several commenters raised concerns with the narrow scope of the EIS and the proposed Area of Permitted Effects (APE), suggesting the APE must be enlarged to encompass the broader historic district, Section 16, and the Washington Core viewshed. The Army has not considered the Memorial itself as a contributing resource to a broader Monument Core and part of the Washington Monumental Corridor Master Plan as explained in Defend Arlington’s comments. As explained, the viewshed from Mount Vernon through to the Capitol, must be included in the NHPA Area of Potential Effects (“APE”), as they are part of the master plan and significant in the north-south reunification and the American Renaissance. The APE must be expanded to include the entire viewshed of the Washington Monumental core. The Army must respond to these concerns, including making a final determination on the scope of review under NEPA and NHPA. Until the question of the appropriate scope of the EIS and the APE is settled, it is impossible to answer the question about effects.</p>